

MICT-12-29
17-02-2016
(3584 - 3582)

3584
ZS

**UNITED
NATIONS**



Mechanism for International Criminal Tribunals

Case No. MICT-12-29
Date: 17 February 2016
Original: English

IN THE APPEALS CHAMBER

Before: Judge Theodor Meron, Presiding
Judge Bakone Justice Moloto
Judge Christoph Flügge
Judge Burton Hall
Judge Liu Daqun

Registrar: Mr. John Hocking

Order of: 17 February 2016

PROSECUTOR

v.

AUGUSTIN NGRIBATWARE

PUBLIC

**ORDER TO RE-FILE MOTION FOR ASSIGNMENT OF
COUNSEL**

The Office of the Prosecutor:

Mr. Hassan Bubacar Jallow

Counsel for Augustin Ngirabatware:

Mr. Peter Robinson

**Received by the Registry
Mechanism for International Criminal Tribunals
17/02/2016 12:31**

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Peter Robinson', written over the stamp.

THE APPEALS CHAMBER of the International Residual Mechanism for Criminal Tribunals (“Appeals Chamber” and “Mechanism”, respectively);

RECALLING that, on 18 December 2014, the Appeals Chamber (i) affirmed Augustin Ngirabatware’s convictions for committing direct and public incitement to commit genocide, and, Judge Moloto dissenting, instigating and aiding and abetting genocide; (ii) reversed his conviction for rape as a crime against humanity; and (iii) imposed a sentence of 30 years of imprisonment;¹

BEING SEISED OF the “Motion for Assignment of Counsel”, filed confidentially and *ex parte* by Ngirabatware on 22 January 2016 (“Motion”), in which he requests that the Appeals Chamber direct the Registrar to assign him counsel, at the expense of the Mechanism, for the purpose of assisting him in relation to the preparation of a request for review;²

NOTING that Ngirabatware filed the Motion confidentially and *ex parte* because, in his view: (i) it relates to a matter in relation to which the Prosecution has no standing; (ii) the release of the information contained in the Motion may result in interference with witnesses; and (iii) the contents of the Motion reveal defence strategy and work product;³

CONSIDERING that, before a review has been authorized, an applicant is only entitled to assigned counsel at the expense of the Mechanism if the Appeals Chamber deems it necessary to ensure the fairness of the proceedings, which is, to a great extent, assessed in light of the potential grounds for review put forward by the applicant;⁴

CONSIDERING that, in general, the Appeals Chamber only authorizes the assignment of counsel at the expense of the Mechanism where it cannot exclude the likelihood of success of a potential ground of review;⁵

CONSIDERING that such a determination necessarily relates to the potential merits of the request for review and as corollary the Prosecution should have the opportunity to respond;⁶

¹ *Augustin Ngirabatware v. The Prosecutor*, Case No. MICT-12-29-A, Judgement, 18 December 2014, para. 279.

² Motion, paras. 1, 14, 23.

³ Motion, n. 1.

⁴ *Eliézer Niyitegeka v. The Prosecutor*, Case No. MICT-12-16-R, Decision on Niyitegeka’s Request for Review and Assignment of Counsel, 13 July 2015 (“*Niyitegeka* Decision of 13 July 2015”), para. 8. *See also* *Aloys Ntabakuze v. The Prosecutor*, Case No. MICT-14-77-R, Decision on Ntabakuze’s *Pro Se* Motion for Assignment of an Investigator and Counsel in Anticipation of his Request for Review, 19 January 2015, para. 9; *Eliézer Niyitegeka v. The Prosecutor*, Case No. MICT-12-16-R, Decision on Niyitegeka’s Request for Assignment of Counsel, 6 November 2014, para. 7; *François Karera v. Prosecutor*, Case No. MICT-12-24-R, Decision on Request for Assignment of Counsel, 4 December 2012, para. 10.

⁵ *See, e.g., Niyitegeka* Decision of 13 July 2015, para. 12; *Jean de Dieu Kamuhanda v. The Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-99-54A-R, Decision on Motion for Legal Assistance, 21 July 2009, para. 18.

CONSIDERING that, while witness protection concerns warrant maintaining the Motion as confidential, Ngirabatware fails to show that there is a risk that the Prosecution may interfere with the witnesses in order to justify its *ex parte* status;

CONSIDERING that, in limited circumstances, particularly sensitive material could be included in an *ex parte* annex so long as the motion is prepared in such a way to allow for a meaningful response;⁷

CONSIDERING that, in view of Ngirabatware's submissions, prior to lifting the *ex parte* status of the Motion, Ngirabatware should have the opportunity to review his Motion in light of the foregoing considerations;


HEREBY ORDERS Ngirabatware to re-file the Motion in conformity with this Order no later than seven days from the filing of this Order;

ORDERS the Prosecution to file a response to the Motion, if any, within 10 days of the re-filing of the Motion; and

ORDERS Ngirabatware to file a reply, if any, within four days of the filing of the Prosecution's response.

Done in English and French, the English version being authoritative.

Done this 17th day of February 2016,
At The Hague,
The Netherlands


Judge Theodor Meron, Presiding

[Seal of the Mechanism]



⁶ In this respect, the Appeals Chamber further notes that, at the review stage, the assignment of counsel under the legal aid system has never been authorized on an *ex parte* basis by the Mechanism or the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda.

⁷ The Appeals Chamber notes that the requirement that an applicant provide information as to the potential grounds for review in the context of a request for the assignment of counsel at the expense of the Mechanism necessarily involves revealing certain aspects of the applicant's strategy in connection with the eventual request for review.



**TRANSMISSION SHEET FOR FILING OF DOCUMENTS WITH THE
MECHANISM FOR INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS/
FICHE DE TRANSMISSION POUR LE DÉPÔT DE DOCUMENTS DEVANT LE
MÉCANISME POUR LES TRIBUNAUX PÉNAUX INTERNATIONAUX**

I - FILING INFORMATION / INFORMATIONS GÉNÉRALES

To/ À :	<input type="checkbox"/> MICT Registry/ Greffe du MPTI		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Arusha/ Arusha		<input type="checkbox"/> The Hague/ La Haye	
From/ De :	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chambers/ Chambre		<input type="checkbox"/> Defence/ Défense		<input type="checkbox"/> Prosecution/ Bureau du Procureur	
Case Name/ Affaire :	Prosecutor v. Augustin Ngirabatware			Case Number/ Affaire n° :	MICT-12-29	
Date Created/ Daté du :	17 February 2016		Date transmitted/ Transmis le :	17 February 2016		No. of Pages/ Nombre de pages : 3
Original Language / Langue de l'original :	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> English/ Anglais		<input type="checkbox"/> French/ Français		<input type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda	
			<input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S		<input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :	
Title of Document/ Titre du document :	Order to Re-file Motion for Assignment of Counsel					
Classification Level/ Catégories de classification :	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Unclassified/ Non classifié		<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte Defence excluded/ Défense exclue			
	<input type="checkbox"/> Confidential/ Confidentiel		<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte Prosecution excluded/ Bureau du Procureur exclu			
	<input type="checkbox"/> Strictly Confidential/ Strictement confidentiel		<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte R86(H) applicant excluded/ Art. 86 H) requérant exclu			
			<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte Amicus Curiae excluded/ Amicus curiae exclu			
			<input type="checkbox"/> Ex Parte other exclusion/ autre(s) partie(s) exclue(s) (specify/préciser) :			
Document type/ Type de document :	<input type="checkbox"/> Motion/ Requête		<input type="checkbox"/> Submission from parties/ Écritures déposées par des parties		<input type="checkbox"/> Indictment/ Acte d'accusation	
	<input type="checkbox"/> Decision/ Décision		<input type="checkbox"/> Submission from non-parties/ Écritures déposées par des tiers		<input type="checkbox"/> Warrant/ Mandat	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Order/ Ordonnance		<input type="checkbox"/> Book of Authorities/ Recueil de sources		<input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Appeal/ Acte d'appel	
	<input type="checkbox"/> Judgement/ Jugement/Arrêt		<input type="checkbox"/> Affidavit/ Déclaration sous serment			

II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE/ ÉTAT DE LA TRADUCTION AU JOUR DU DÉPÔT

<input type="checkbox"/> Translation not required/ La traduction n'est pas requise						
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and requests the Registry to translate/ La partie déposante ne soumet que l'original et sollicite que le Greffe prenne en charge la traduction : (Word version of the document is attached/ La version Word est jointe)						
<input type="checkbox"/> English/ Anglais		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> French/ Français		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda		<input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S
						<input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :
<input type="checkbox"/> Filing Party hereby submits both the original and the translated version for filing, as follows/ La partie déposante soumet l'original et la version traduite aux fins de dépôt, comme suit :						
Original/ Original en	<input type="checkbox"/> English/ Anglais		<input type="checkbox"/> French/ Français		<input type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda	
					<input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S	
					<input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :	
Translation/ Traduction en	<input type="checkbox"/> English/ Anglais		<input type="checkbox"/> French/ Français		<input type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda	
					<input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S	
					<input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :	
<input type="checkbox"/> Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s)/ La partie déposante soumettra la (les) version(s) traduite(s) sous peu, dans la (les) langue(s) suivante(s) :						
<input type="checkbox"/> English/ Anglais		<input type="checkbox"/> French/ Français		<input type="checkbox"/> Kinyarwanda		<input type="checkbox"/> B/C/S
						<input type="checkbox"/> Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :

Send completed transmission sheet to/ Veuillez soumettre cette fiche dûment remplie à :
JudicialFilingsArusha@un.org OR/OU JudicialFilingsHague@un.org

Rev: April 2014/Rév. : Avril 2014